2

3

Ageing Assessment of a Wind Turbine over Time by Interpreting Wind Farm SCADA Data

- Juchuan Dai^{a,b}, Wenxian Yang^{b, c}*, Junwei Cao^a, Deshun Liu^a, Xing Long^d 4 ^a School of Electromechanical Engineering, Hunan University of Science and Technology, Xiangtan 411201, 5 China 6 ^b School of Engineering, Newcastle University, Newcastle upon Tyne NE1 7RU, UK 7 ^c Hunan Province Cooperative Innovation Centre for Wind Power Equipment and Energy Conversion, Hunan 8 9 Institute of Engineering, Xiangtan 411104, China ^d XEMC Windpower Co., Ltd., Xiangtan 411000, China 10 11 12 Abstract: Ageing of a wind turbine and its components is inevitable. It will affect the reliability and power generation of the turbine over time. Therefore, performing the ageing assessment of wind turbines is of 13 14 significance not only to optimize the operation and maintenance strategy of the wind turbine but also to improve 15 the management of a wind farm. However, in contrast to the significant number of research on wind turbine 16 condition monitoring and reliability analysis, little effort was made before to investigate the ageing led performance degradation issue of wind turbines over time. To fill such a technology gap, four SCADA-based 17 18 wind turbine ageing assessment criteria are proposed in this paper for measuring the ageing resultant 19 performance degradation of the turbine. With the aid of these four criteria, a reliable information fusion based wind turbine ageing assessment method is developed and verified in the end using the real wind farm SCADA 20 21 data. It has been shown that the proposed method is effective and reliable in performing the ageing assessment 22 of a wind turbine.
- 23

24 Keywords: Wind turbines; Ageing assessment; Performance degradation; SCADA data

25

26 1. Introduction¹

With the rapid development of wind power industry, there is an increasing need to lower the Cost of Energy (COE) 27 28 of wind power [1]. In recent years, effort has been made to develop advanced condition monitoring and maintenance 29 optimization techniques in order to improve the safety and availability of wind turbines, such as the advanced 30 condition monitoring techniques developed based on wavelet transform [2] and wavelet-transform [3, 4]; the 31 condition-based maintenance strategies [5]; and son on. The research results do significantly improve the operation 32 and maintenance activities in wind farms. For example, based on a robust fault reconstruction technique the considered 33 faults and system states are simultaneously reconstructed [6]. In the meantime, to better manage the wind power assets, 34 a number of reliability related research, including reliability-centered maintenance (RCM) analysis [7], reliability 35 analysis with incomplete failure data[8], reliability analysis based on failure modes and effects analysis[9], were also

^{*} Corresponding author. Tel +44(0)191 208 6171

E-mail address: Wenxian.Yang@newcastle.ac.uk

conducted to understand the reliability of wind turbines and their components. The interesting findings from these 36 analyses do provide a global view of the reliability issues existing in the present wind industry, which is very helpful 37 38 not only to improve the reliability design of the turbine but also to develop right insurance policies for wind power 39 facilities. In summary, all these previous efforts on both condition monitoring and reliability analysis actually 40 accelerate the development of wind power industry. However, the ageing effect, which not only affects energy 41 capture[10], but also affects the reliability and operation of wind turbines, has not been fully paid attention to. The designed life of a wind turbine is normally 20-25 years for onshore and 25-30 years for offshore. During the service 42 43 period, it is inevitable that the reliability and performance of the turbine will degrade over time due to ageing effect. 44 Such degradation will more or less reduce the performance of the turbine. However, it is still not a fault because it 45 does not affect delivering the normal function of any wind turbine component. Since the conventional wind turbine 46 condition monitoring techniques are usually focused on fault detection and diagnosis[11, 12], therefore not ideal for 47 dealing with this kind of ageing issues. So far, research on the wind turbine ageing issue has not been reported in the 48 open literature, although it does accompany the service of a wind turbine. Moreover, harsh operational environments 49 (e.g. the wet and corrosive offshore environment) and aggressive loading conditions (e.g. the loads induced by 50 turbulent wind and storm) can accelerate the ageing issues. Therefore, it is of great significance to carry out the ageing 51 assessment, which will benefit the life management of a wind turbine and thereby maximize its economic return. The 52 preliminary research reported in this paper is just in order to reach such a purpose.

53 Wind farms are equipped with supervisory control and data acquisition (SCADA) system, which collects data from 54 critical components of wind turbines in order to understand turbines' operational condition and control them from 55 distance in the case of necessity. In recent years, the added value of wind farm SCADA data is further explored in 56 the field of wind turbine condition monitoring. For example, a fault prediction method was proposed and some data-57 mining algorithms were used to develop models predicting potential faults in [13]; wind turbine gearbox was 58 monitored through analyzing lube oil and bearing temperature data in [14]; SCADA-based clustering and principal 59 component analysis were used for diagnosing gearbox failure in [15]; multivariate state estimation technique and 60 moving window calculation were used to estimate the wind turbine gearbox temperature in [16]; a multi-agent system architecture was used to corroborate various interpretation technique output, provide performance evaluation and 61 62 early fault identification in [17]; adaptive neuro-fuzzy interference system was used to develop SCADA-based wind 63 turbine condition monitoring system in [18, 19]; an effective SCADA data processing method and the associated 64 quantitative health condition assessment method were developed in [20]; the inner-DBSCAN (density-based spatial clustering of applications with noise) algorithm for monitoring the wind turbine operation condition was developed 65 66 in [21]. However, almost all these research are linked to condition monitoring, fault diagnosis and fault prediction of 67 wind turbines. The effort for dealing with the ageing issues of wind turbines is still insufficient. As mentioned in [20, 68 22, 23], SCADA data are not ideal for conducting a full condition monitoring of a wind turbine due to their low 69 sampling frequency. But they could be more suitable to be applied to investigate the ageing led performance 70 degradation issues of a wind turbine as the low-sampling-rated SCADA data can describe the performance of a wind 71 turbine in a long time. This is why wind farm SCADA data is used in this paper to develop the ageing assessment 72 technique for wind turbines.

73 In summary, the key scientific contributions of this paper are

- A feasible method of performing ageing assessment of wind turbines using wind farm SCADA is proposed
- following the discussion of a number of SCADA parameters that can indicate the ageing of different wind turbine
 components;
- A more reliable information fusion based method is further developed to assure the reliability of ageing
 assessment conclusion.
- 79

80 2. SCADA parameters for ageing assessment

81 SCADA data are the data collected from the key components of wind turbines by wind farm SCADA system, which 82 include a number of parameters, reflecting the operation and status of the turbines in the wind farm. But in practice, 83 the SCADA parameters being collected from different concepts of wind turbines may be different. For example, the 84 turbines considered in this paper are gearless direct-drive permanent magnet wind turbines. The SCADA data 85 collected from them include wind speed, rotor speed, pitch angle, nacelle vibration, wind direction, yaw angle, 86 generator power, generator current, generator frequency, generator torque, hub azimuth, converter current, converter 87 pressure, converter temperature, hub temperature, temperature of the main bearing, power of pitch motor, hydraulic 88 brake pressure, etc. All these parameters are important to ensure the safety and efficient operation of the turbines. 89 However, not all of them are really useful for conducting the ageing assessment. Therefore, the useful SCADA 90 parameters for conducting wind turbine ageing assessment will be identified first from these data in this research. 91 Then, a few ageing assessment criteria will be designed based on the identified SCADA parameters specifically for 92 assessing the performance degradation of the key parts of the wind turbine being investigated.

93 **2.1. Modelling output power**

94 The stability of output power at corresponding wind speed is one of the important criteria for assessing the 95 performance of a wind turbine. The assessment is based on the following two assumptions, i.e. (1) under the same 96 operational and weather condition (i.e. wind speed, wind direction, temperature, humidity etc.), the power generated 97 by the wind turbine at the corresponding wind speed should be approximately same; (2) when wind speed is above 98 the rated wind speed, the output power should be constantly close to the rated power of the turbine despite the change 99 of operational and weather conditions. If presuming the yaw angle of the nacelle is always right, then, in theory, the 100 fluctuation of output power is basically dependent on the variations of air density, wind speed, rotor speed, and pitch 101 angle of rotor blade, as shown in equation (1) [24, 25].

$$\Delta P = \frac{1}{2} (\rho + \Delta \rho) (\nu + \Delta \nu)^3 \pi R^2 \cdot C_p \left(\frac{(\omega + \Delta \omega) R}{\nu + \Delta \nu}, (\beta + \Delta \beta) \right)$$
(1)

103 where, Δ indicates fluctuation, *P* refers to the output power, ρ is air density, ν is air velocity, *R* is rotor diameter, C_p 104 is power coefficient, and β is the pitch angle of the blade. Among these variables, rotor speed ω and pitch angle β 105 can be controlled based on requirements, while wind speed and air density are uncontrollable.

From (1), it can be inferred that the amount of power fluctuation under different operational and weather conditions will be different. For this reason, to ensure the reliability of the assessment, the method that is used for evaluating the power fluctuation should be less dependent or independent of the weather and operational conditions of the turbine. In order to try best to meet such a requirement, in this paper, the power fluctuation is investigated only when the wind speed is above the rated wind speed. This is because the pitch control system of the wind turbine starts to work only when wind speed is above the rated wind speed. In this scenario, through blade pitch control, the output power from

wind turbine generator is constrained around the rated power in spite of the change of wind condition. By contrast, 112 the pitch control system of the wind turbine will not work when wind speed is below the rated wind speed. As shown 113 114 in Fig.1, to reach a constant output power, the blade pitch control system of a variable speed wind turbine will be trigged on as soon as the measured power exceeds the power demand. Then, the output power will be controlled by 115 adjusting the pitch angle of the blade β , which will influence the aerodynamic characteristics of the wind turbine as 116 long as the turbine converter can successfully fix the rotational speed of turbine rotor. In other words, assume the 117 power electronic convert of the turbine works properly, the rotor speed in this region will be almost constant (i.e. 118 119 $\Delta \omega \rightarrow 0$). Then, the power fluctuation ΔP will mainly rely on the accuracy of blade pitch control. Accordingly, the 120 output power fluctuation ΔP is used in this paper mainly to reflect the ageing issue of blade pitch control system, 121 which has shown lots of reliability issues in wind farm. But it is worthy to note that such a strategy is subject to that 122 the wind turbine converter is in good condition and is able to carry out a perfect control of rotor speed.





Fig.1 Power control structure of wind turbines when wind speed is above the rated wind speed

125 **2.2. Power coefficient**

Power coefficient C_p is a criterion indicating the capability of the wind turbine in capturing and converting aerodynamic energy in wind to electric power. In SCADA system, the collected power is the power output of the wind turbine generator rather than the energy of all wind flowing into the wind turbine rotor, so the power coefficient can be mathematically expressed as

130

$$C_p = \frac{P}{W} = \frac{2P}{\rho v^3 \pi R^2} \tag{2}$$

where, *W* is the total aerodynamic energy of the wind passing through the sweep area of the wind turbine rotor; *P* isoutput power of the generator.

From (2), it can be inferred that if overlooking the ignorable energy loss that is consumed by wind turbine drive train and control system, the value of C_p is affected mainly by the aerodynamic performance of wind turbine rotors and the energy conversion efficiency of the generator. For a permanent magnet generator, the degradation of the latter can be induced by either the demagnetization of magnetic material or the ageing issues of wires.

The relationship between the aerodynamic characteristics of wind rotor (lift and drag coefficients of airfoil sections)and the energy that it can capture from the wind is expressed as [25, 26]

139
$$P = \omega \int_{0}^{R} \frac{1}{2} \rho c \frac{v_0 \omega r^2 (1-a)(1+a')}{\sin \phi \cos \phi} (C_l \sin \phi - C_d \cos \phi) dr$$
(3)

140 where, ω is rotor speed; r stands for the distance of an airfoil section from the root of the blade; C_i and C_d are 141 respectively the lift and drag coefficients of the airfoil; v_0 is the axial wind velocity; a and a' are axial and tangential 142 induced velocity coefficients, respectively; ϕ is inflow angle; c is chord length of the airfoil.

- From (3), it can be seen that the value of P is dependent on lift coefficient, drag coefficient, and induced velocity coefficient and in turn, any change of these three parameters due to blade damage will significantly affect the value of P.
- As the SCADA data used in this paper are from permanent magnet synchronous direct drive wind turbines, herein the ageing issue of the permanent magnet generator is considered. The power generated by a permanent magnet
- 148generator can be expressed as [27-29]

149

164

170

$$P = \frac{3}{2} p [\psi_f i_{sq} + (L_{sd} - L_{sq}) i_{sd} i_{sq}] \omega$$
(4)

where, *p* is the number of pole pairs; ψ_f is the permanent magnet magnetic field; i_{sd} and i_{sq} are *d* axis and *q* axis components of stator currents, respectively; L_{sd} and L_{sq} are *d* axis and *q* axis inductances of the stator, respectively.

- It is necessary to note that the model shown in (4) uses the *d-q* rotating coordinate system on the rotor as the reference coordinate system, the *d* axis is directed to the rotor pole axis, and the *q* axis is ahead of the *d* axis for 90 electric angles. From Eq. (4), it is clearly seen that with the increase of service time, the decreased permanent magnet magnetic field ψ_f will have a direct impact on output power.
- For the aforementioned reasons derived from (3) and (4), power coefficient C_p is used in this paper to indicate the performance degradation of wind turbine blade and generator.

158 **2.3. Nacelle vibration**

Nacelle vibration can be excited by many factors. Apart from being affected by external loads, the vibration measured from wind turbine nacelle is also influenced by the integrity of the tower and other support and fixture structures of the turbine. Once the stiffness and damping of these structures change due to ageing, the vibration of the nacelle will increase over time. The external loads acting on wind turbines are mainly from the wind. According to the BEM theory, the axial force acting on the blades is [25, 26, 30]

$$dN = \frac{1}{2}\rho c \frac{v_0^2 (1-a)^2}{\sin^2 \phi} (C_l \cos \phi + C_d \sin \phi) dr$$
(5)

165 where, *dN* is the axial force acting on the blades.

Despite the rich number of excitations, the nacelle vibration can be simply manifested using a mechanical dynamics model as shown in Fig.2. Once ageing happens during the service, the structural stiffness and damping will deviate from their original states, which will consequently lead to the change in nacelle vibration. Such a process can be simply expressed as

 $m_{N} = c_{N} + kx = F_{N}$

(6)

171 where, F_N represents the exciting load.

Based on this consideration, the nacelle vibration is used in this paper to describe the performance degradation of the tower and other support and fixture structures of wind turbines.



Fig.2 Mass-spring-damping model of the nacelle

176 **2.4. Key component temperature**

The temperature of the main bearing, which is one of the key components of wind turbines, is monitored by wind 177 178 turbine SCADA system. Besides the presence of defect, the bearing temperature can be influenced also by external 179 loads, the quality of lubrication oil, the condition of bearing components, the axis electric current, environmental 180 temperature, etc., see Fig.3. Over the course of service, both the physical properties of lubrication oil and the worn 181 state of bearing components will change due to ageing issues and moreover, the external fatigue loads and axis electric 182 current can accelerate the change. Consequently, the bearing cannot run efficiently anymore when ageing effect 183 becomes significant. Hence, more energy loss will occur in bearing operation, part of which will be present in the thermal form, i.e. temperature. Therefore, the temperature of the main bearing will increase to a certain extent when 184 185 ageing effect becomes significant. For this reason, the bearing temperature is used in this paper as a criterion to 186 indicate the ageing issue of the wind turbine main bearing.



187 188

Fig.3 Influence factors of main bearing temperature

189 **3. Ageing assessment method**

190 To implement successful ageing assessment, it is critical to design reliable assessment criteria based on the four

191 SCADA parameters identified in Section 2. However, the relevant research has never been reported in previous

192 literature. The work presented in this section is in order to fill such a technology gap.

193 **3.1. Assessment criteria**

194 (1) Criterion for characterizing the fluctuation of output power

195 A criterion is proposed to characterize the fluctuation of output power in the scenario when the wind speed is above

196 the rated wind speed. It can be calculated by following the steps:

i) **Data preparation**. As shown in Section 2.1, the output power data used for assessing the fluctuation are only those

198 collected when the wind speed is above the rated wind speed. Moreover, in order to assure the accuracy of the

evaluation, the invalid data (e.g. null data, singularity data, etc.) and those measured when the turbine is faulty and
at standby should be taken out first before the calculation. After preparing the data using such a method, the trimmed
data used for fluctuation assessment can be expressed as

202

$$D_k = [v_{ki}, P_{ki}] \qquad (i = 1, 2, \cdots, n)$$

where, $v_{ki} > v_{rate}$, v_{rate} represents the rated wind speed; *k* indicates the sample number; *n* indicates the total number of data obtained after filtering during a certain period.

Then the absolute fluctuation of the output power ΔP during the period could be characterized by the standard deviation of the output power, i.e.

$$\Delta p_k = \sqrt{\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \left(P_i - \overline{P}\right)^2} \tag{7}$$

where, \overline{P} stands for the average of P_i . Herein, a big value of Δp_k will indicate a large fluctuation of the output power.

Assume the SCADA data available for this assessment contain *N* sets of data, i.e. $\mathbf{D} = \{D_1, D_2, \dots, D_N\}$, then a series of data $\Delta \mathbf{P} = \{\Delta p_1, \Delta p_2, \dots, \Delta p_N\}$ can be obtained in the end. In fact, in addition to the standard deviation, some other methods, e.g. $\Delta P_k = \max(P_i) - \min(P_i)$, are also feasible for describing power fluctuation. They all can be used for ageing assessment.

ii) **Reliable estimation of output power fluctuation**. In order to assure the reliability of assessment, the calculated set of data $\Delta P = \{\Delta p_1, \Delta p_2, \dots, \Delta p_N\}$ are further processed with the aid of Kernel Density Estimation (KDE) [31-33]. The kernel density estimation can be implemented by

217
$$\hat{f}_h(x) = \frac{1}{Nh} \sum_{i=1}^N K\left(\frac{x - X_i}{h}\right)$$
(8)

where, $K(\cdot) \ge 0$ is a kernel function, which satisfies the condition of $\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} K(x) dx = 1$. In this paper, the Gaussian function $K(u) = e^{-0.5u^2/\sqrt{2\pi}}$ is used as the kernel function for calculation. X_i is the element contained in ΔP . Parameter *h* refers to window width to ensure the estimated kernel density curve $\hat{f}_h(x)$ can best fit the distribution of ΔP .

Let the variable x in (8) changes continuously from min(ΔP) to max(ΔP) and substitute the elements of ΔP into (8), a kernel density curve, as shown in Fig.4, can be obtained. Then, the expected value of Δp can be readily

determined from the kernel density curve. It is the value of 'x' that corresponds to the maximum value of $\hat{f}_h(x)$.





Fig.4 Estimated output power fluctuation through kernel density analysis

227 iii) Criterion for assessing the ageing of wind turbine control system. To assess the performance degradation of

the wind turbine control system due to the effect of ageing, the following criterion δ_p is developed, i.e.

$$\delta_p = \frac{\Delta P_T}{\Delta P_B} \tag{9}$$

where, ΔP_B is the benchmark value of the output power fluctuation obtained when the wind turbine is at its early service life, ΔP_T is the current value of the output power fluctuation.

232

237 238

239

229

233 (2) Criterion for characterizing the change of power coefficient

234 Since the wind turbine works with different values of power coefficient at different operation stages, it is necessary

to think about which stage is most appropriate for performing the assessment of the ageing resultant change of power coefficient. Therefore, a schematic power generation diagram of the wind turbine is plotted in Fig.5.



Fig.5 Relationship between rotor speed and power [34]

From Fig.5, it can be seen that the operation of the turbine consists of 5 stages, namely starting (region 1), first transition (region 2), maximum power point tracking (region 3), second transition (region 4), and full power (region 5). Although SCADA data are collected from all regions in Fig.5, a specific region will be deliberately selected when calculating an individual criterion. Since power coefficient is almost constant in region 3, the data collected in which are used to reach a reliable estimation of the change of power coefficient. In contrast, in the other regions, the value of power coefficient varies over time with the change of wind speed. As a consequence, it is unlikely to reach a reliable estimation of the change from such data.

The theoretical maximum value of power coefficient C_P of a wind turbine has been defined at the design stage and the turbine is deemed to keep tracking of it when operating in region 3. When a fault occurs in the turbine, the measured value of C_P will drop down. But this does not mean that in region 3, the C_P value is constantly the maximum value in the absence of a fault. The value of C_P will change in a large range when the turbine performance degrades over time due to the ageing of key components (e.g. blade and generator). This is why C_P is selected as a criterion for assessing the performance degradation of wind turbine rotor blades and generator. To obtain a reliable assessment, the following computing algorithm is developed.

i) **Data preparation**. To fully avoid the negative influences of unstable wind speed and downtime of the turbine on calculation results, the SCADA data (i.e. wind speed ν , rotor speed ω and generator output power *P*) collected in region 3 are sorted using rotor speed. Such a data sorting strategy is based on the fact that the turbine can generate electric power only when its rotor is running despite the value of wind speed. Following this method, in a certain time period, a number of SCADA data that are valid for this assessment can be readily obtained. They are

259
$$Y_k = |v_{ki}, \omega_{ki}, P_{ki}|, (i = 1, 2, \dots n)$$

260 where, k indicates the order of time period; n is the number of data collected during the period. Herein, rotor speed

varies in the range of $[\omega_{3min}, \omega_{3max}]$, where ω_{3min} and ω_{3max} are respectively the minimum and maximum rotor speeds in region 3.

263 ii) **Reliable estimation of power coefficient**. Due to the inertia of turbine rotor, the output power cannot give an 264 immediate response to the change of wind speed. For this reason, it is not rational to calculate C_p directly using (2). 265 Therefore, an improvement was made, i.e.

266

$$C_{Pk} = \frac{\int_{t_1}^{t_2} P(t)dt}{\int_{t_1}^{t_2} \frac{1}{2} \rho v(t)^3 \pi R^2 dt}$$
(10)

(13)

where all relevant data in a time period $[t_1, t_2]$, rather than only the instant values of *P* and *v* measured at a specific moment, are used for the calculation. Thus, the calculated result by (10) can better reflect the actual power coefficient of the turbine than equation (2) does. In the calculation, air density ρ is dependent on temperature, humidity and atmospheric pressure in the wind farm, i.e.[35]

271
$$\rho = \frac{p_{ma}}{R_{da}T} [1 - 0.378 \frac{\varphi p_s(t)}{p_{ma}}]$$
(11)

where, R_{da} is dry air constant; φ is the relative humidity of the air; $p_s(t)$ is the water vapor saturation pressure when the temperature is *t*, Pa; p_{ma} is the pressure of the moist air, Pa.

In practical calculation, the power coefficient is estimated using the following discrete form, i.e.

275
$$C_{P}(k) = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} P(kT)}{\sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{1}{2} \rho v(kT)^{3} \pi R^{2}}$$
(12)

Assume the SCADA data collected in *N* time periods, i.e. $Y = \{Y_1, Y_2, \dots, Y_N\}$, are valid for performing this assessment, then a series of calculation results of C_p can be obtained, i.e. $C_p = \{C_{P1}, C_{P2}, \dots, C_{PN}\}$. Then, the KDE method illustrated in (8) will be used to further improve the reliability of the estimation result of power coefficient. Likewise, the *x* value at which the maximum value of the nuclear density occurs is regarded as the final assessment result of the C_p during the whole testing period.

281 iii) Criterion for assessing the ageing of power dependent components. To assess the performance degradation 282 of the wind turbine blade and generator, the following criterion δ_{Cp} is developed, i.e.

 $\delta_{C_P} = rac{C_{PB}}{C_{PT}}$

where C_{PB} is the benchmark value of the power coefficient obtained when the wind turbine is at its young age, C_{PT} is the power coefficient that the wind turbine exhibits at present.

From (13), it can be inferred that the more the value of δ_{Cp} deviates from 1, the more serious the turbine performance degradation tends to be.

288

283

289 (3) Criterion for characterizing the change of nacelle vibration

290 During the operation of a wind turbine, the vibration of the nacelle is constantly monitored by the SCADA system.

Assume the nacelle vibrations measured in horizontal and vertical directions are respectively a_x and a_y , then the

ageing resultant performance degradation of wind turbine structure can be inferred from a_x and a_y . The method

293 developed for performing such an assessment is shown in the following.

i) Data preparation. Nacelle vibration data of the wind turbine at rated wind speed is selected as

$$Z_k = [v_k, a_{xk}]$$

296 where, $v_k = v_{rated}$, $k = 1, 2, \dots, N$ indicates the number of each sample data.

297 ii) **Reliable estimation of nacelle vibration.** Using the data a_{xk} and a_{yk} that are measured in two mutually 298 perpendicular directions, the synthetic vibration of wind turbine nacelle can be readily derived, i.e.

 $,a_{vk}$

299

295

$$a_k = \sqrt{a_{xk}^2 + a_{yk}^2}$$
(14)

Thus, a series of nacelle synthetic vibration data $a = \{a_1, a_2, \dots, a_N\}$ can be obtained in the end. Then, apply the KDE method described by (8) to identifying the reliable synthetic vibration of the wind turbine nacelle Z_i , which corresponds to the peak value on the kernel density curve. Herein, subscript '*i*' indicates the KDE resultant reliable nacelle synthetic vibration obtained from the data measured in the *i*th time period. Assume the nacelle vibration data used for the ageing degradation assessment are measured respectively during *M* time periods, then a series of reliable nacelle vibration data $\mathbf{Z} = \{Z_1, Z_2, \dots, Z_M\}$ can be obtained at last.

306 iii) Criterion for assessing the ageing of structures. To assess the ageing led degradation of wind turbine tower 307 and other support structures of wind turbines, the following criterion δ_a is developed, i.e.

308

311

$$\delta_a = \frac{\tilde{Z}}{Z_b} \tag{15}$$

309 where Z_b is the benchmark value of nacelle vibration obtained when the wind turbine is normally operating at its 310 young age, \tilde{Z} is the KDE result of the series of data $\boldsymbol{Z} = \{Z_1, Z_2, \dots, Z_M\}$.

312 (4) Criterion for characterizing the variation of main bearing temperature

313 In the practice of wind power generation, the operating temperature of the wind turbine main bearing is monitored 314 usually by a pair of temperature sensors that are symmetrically installed on the bearing. To achieve a reliable ageing 315 assessment result, only those temperature data collected at the rated wind speed and the same environmental 316 temperature are used to perform the assessment. It is understandable that when comparing the same criterion obtained in different time periods, the constraint conditions should be same. However, the constraint conditions cannot be 317 318 absolutely consistent. Furthermore, except the external environmental conditions, the wind turbine running mode (for 319 example, down power regulation mode) can affect the bearing temperature. In order to minimize the impact of the 320 kind of uncertainties on the reliability of the assessment result, in addition to defining a specific operating condition 321 in which the assessment is undertaken, the collected data will be further processed using KDE (Kernel Density 322 Estimation) method in the paper to assure a reliable assessment. Assume the temperature measurement results by the 323 two sensors are respectively T_a and T_b , then the method for characterizing the temperature variation can be described as follows. 324

i) **Data preparation**. Considering the bearing temperature can be different under different loading and operating conditions of the turbine, the temperature data used for this assessment are collected only when wind speed reaches the rated wind speed. Accordingly, the following set of data W_k is obtained over the course of the k^{th} time period, i.e.

- $W_k = \begin{bmatrix} v_k, T_{ak}, T_{bk} \end{bmatrix}$
- 330 where v_k is constantly equal to the rated wind speed. T_{ak} and T_{bk} are the average values of the temperature data

collected respectively by the two sensors during the k^{th} time period. Repeat the data collection and finally obtain N sets of data for assessment, i.e. $\mathbf{W} = \{W_1, W_2, \dots, W_N\}$.

333 ii) Reliable estimation of temperature. Use arithmetic average method to process T_{ak} and T_{bk} , has

$$T_k = \frac{T_{ak} + T_{bk}}{2} \tag{16}$$

Apply (16) to processing all N sets of data, then a series of data $T = \{T_1, T_2, \dots, T_N\}$ can be obtained in the end.

Likewise, apply the KDE method to process data T to obtain the reliable estimation of main bearing temperature T_T through detecting the peak value on the resultant kernel density curve.

338 iii) Criterion for assessing the ageing of main bearing. To assess the performance degradation of wind turbine 339 main bearing due to the effect of ageing, the following criterion δ_t is developed, i.e.

$$\delta_t = \frac{T_T}{T_B} \tag{17}$$

341 where T_B is the benchmark value of main bearing temperature obtained when the wind turbine normally operates at 342 its young age.

343

340

334

344 **3.2. Ageing assessment methods**

345 Based on the four assessment criteria proposed above, there are the following two optional methods can be used 346 to assess the ageing resultant performance degradation issue of the wind turbine over time.

347 (1) Conventional method

The method achieves the assessment by respectively investigating the variation tendency of each criterion over time. Therefore, the deviation of any one of the four criteria from its benchmark value will imply the presence of ageing degradation in the turbine performance. Accordingly, the larger deviation indicates a worse ageing issue. Such a method is simple and easy to implement. Moreover, it can help us to identify readily the wind turbine subassemblies that are suffering more ageing issue. However, such a method can hardly provide a reliable description of the ageing situation of the whole turbine system. To address this issue, the sum of all four criteria was proposed to be a new criterion for ageing assessment, i.e.

355

$$\delta = \delta_p + \delta_{Cp} + \delta_a + \delta_t \tag{18}$$

However, such a method treats the four performance assessment criteria equally without any identification, which could lead to unreliable assessment due to unreasonably amplifying or weakening the roles of the four criteria in ageing assessment.

359 (2) Information fusion method

The long-term wind farm practice has shown that the aforementioned four assessment criteria play different roles in reflecting the overall performance of the wind turbine. Therefore, they should be treated differently. For this reason, the first information fusion based method shown in (18) is further improved by assigning an appropriate weighting factor to each criterion, i.e.

364

$$\begin{cases} \delta = r_1 \cdot \delta_p + r_2 \cdot \delta_{Cp} + r_3 \cdot \delta_a + r_4 \cdot \delta_t \\ r_1 + r_2 + r_3 + r_4 = 1 \end{cases}$$
(19)

365 where r_1 , r_2 , r_3 and r_4 are the weighting factors being assigned respectively to the four assessment criteria.

366 Since the values of four criteria are all equal to 1 in the absence of ageing, the value of the comprehensive ageing criterion should normally be equal to 1. Its value will deviate from 1 once ageing happens on the turbine. Undoubtedly, 367 368 the application of these four weighting factors is helpful to reach a more reliable ageing assessment result. However, 369 how to determine the appropriate values of these four weighting factors, in reality, is challenging. Up to date, there 370 is no any relevant research has been reported in open literature. To address this issue, a deliberately designed 371 questionnaire is assigned to four experienced engineers, who all have been working in the field of wind farm operation 372 and maintenance for over 15 years. The questionnaire was designed to ask the interviewees to answer a few small 373 questions regarding the influences of the ageing of different wind turbine components/subassemblies on the power 374 generation performance of the turbine. The influences were marked with the values scaling from 1 to 10. Then, after 375 receiving the completed questionnaire these values will be normalized to obtain the corresponding values of 376 weighting factors through assuming the sum of these weighting factors is equal to 1. The survey results received from 377 these four engineers are listed in Table 1.

Table 1. Weighting factors assigned to the four ageing assessment criteria

3	7	8
-	'	v

Criterion weight	Power fluctuation weight <i>r</i> ₁	C_p weight r_2	Vibration weight r_3	Temperature weight r_4
expert1	0.2	0.5	0.2	0.1
expert2	0.1	0.4	0.2	0.3
expert3	0.1	0.5	0.2	0.2
expert4	0.1	0.5	0.1	0.3
average value	0.125	0.475	0.175	0.225

379

380

From Table 1, it is clearly seen that the weights of the four assessment criteria from different experts are more or less different. Nevertheless, their consensus is that in contrast to power fluctuation, nacelle vibration, and main bearing temperature, power coefficient C_p is more alert to the performance degradation of the turbine due to ageing issue. Therefore, in order to highlight the engineers' researchers' consensus whilst also fully take into account their dissent, the values that they proposed to each weighting factor are averaged in this paper for further calculations. They are $r_1 = 0.125$, $r_2 = 0.475$, $r_3 = 0.175$ and $r_4 = 0.225$, respectively.

387 **4. Verification of the proposed method**

388 Since the ageing of a wind turbine is characterized by the gradual degradation of its performance change (e.g. power 389 coefficient change) over time, it is taken for granted that the ageing effect of a turbine can be assessed through 390 observing the developing tendency of the criterion being investigated.

Based on the above discussion, the calculations and analyses for performing the proposed ageing assessment is summarized in Fig.6. To demonstrate the verification steps, a 2MW direct-drive wind turbine is selected as an example (called unit #1), which was installed in 2011. SCADA data collected from this wind turbine respectively in March 2015 and January 2016 are used. The sampling frequency of the SCADA system is 1Hz. The wind speed and corresponding power fluctuation data collected in an interval are shown in Figs.7a and 7b. There is a total of 1.7×10^4

- 396 sets of data are used for performing power fluctuation assessment. When investigating the fluctuation of power, wind speeds should be basically same in order to ensure that the estimation is conducted under the 'basically same' control 397 398 and operational conditions, so that a more reliable estimation can be reached. Subsequently, Eq. (7) is used to calculate 399 the power fluctuation criterion when n = 10. The value of parameter *n* takes into account the influences of the inertia 400 of rotor, the characteristics of the generator and the control of the turbine. Due to the inertia of rotor, both rotor speed 401 and the power generated by the wind turbine generator are unable to respond to the instantaneous change in wind speed [30]. Then, the histograms of the absolute fluctuation of the output power ΔP and the resultant kernel density 402 403 curves are obtained. The results are shown in Figs.8a and 8b.
- 404





Fig.6 Flow chart of the proposed calculations and analyses for ageing assessment



13





423 424 425

Fig.8 Histogram and kernel density estimation of power fluctuation

426 Subsequently, the ageing effect on wind turbine power coefficient was also investigated. There are total 1.8×10^4 427 sets of data are collected. According to the recorded wind farm temperature, humidity, and atmospheric pressure data, the air density is calculated first using (11). The result is about 1.226 kg/m³ in data selection period in 2015 and 1.243 428 429 kg/m³ in 2016, respectively. Then, use (12) to calculate power coefficient C_p . The histograms of the calculated C_p 430 and the corresponding kernel density curves for both time periods are shown in Figs.9a and 9b. From Figs.9a and 9b, 431 it is found that the calculated value of power coefficient varies in a wide range. However, in theory it should be 432 constant because the SCADA data used for this calculation was from the maximum power point tracking (MPPT) 433 region (see Fig.5), in which the wind turbine power coefficient is constantly equal to the maximum value of power coefficient C_{pmax} . This is normal because the actual wind speed constantly varies time by time, which leads 434 435 instantaneous change of the calculated power coefficient. In other words, the operation of the wind turbine cannot 436 exactly follow the instantaneous change of wind speed. Thus, calculation errors occur inevitably in Figs.9a and 9b. 437 Anyway, the application of KDE can significantly minimize the unreliability of estimation. From Figs.9a and 9b, it 438 is found that the reliable estimation values of the power coefficient are 0.356 in 2015 and 0.327 in 2016. Then, take the value obtained in 2015 as the benchmark value, apply (13) to calculate the criterion δ_{Cp} . The result is $\delta_{Cp} = 1.089$, which deviates from 1. Thus, it seems to indicate a significant ageing effect on power coefficient in one year.



443 444

454

455 456

457 458

442

Fig.9 Histogram and kernel density estimation of power coefficient

Likewise, use the proposed methods and the data collected $(1.7 \times 10^4 \text{ sets of data})$ in 2015 and 2016 to calculate the 445 446 changes of nacelle vibration and main bearing temperature as well. The resultant histograms and the corresponding 447 kernel density curves are shown in Figs. 10a and 10b and Figs. 11a and 11b, respectively. From the figures, it is known that the reliable estimation of the nacelle vibration a in 2015 is 0.19 m/s² and the vibration in 2016 is 0.16 m/s²; the 448 reliable estimation of the main bearing temperature in 2015 is 48.1 °C and the temperature in 2016 is 48.4 °C. 449 Environmental temperature in both 2015 and 2016 is 5.8±0.2 °C in the time interval of producing SCADA data for 450 451 main bearing temperature. Take the estimation results from the data in 2015 as benchmark data, both criteria δ_a and 452 δ_t are calculated. The results are $\delta_a = 0.842$ and $\delta_t = 1.006$. Both deviate from 1 thus seems to indicate the ageing 453 effect on nacelle vibration and main bearing temperature in the past one year.





Fig.11 Histogram and kernel density estimation of bearing temperature

461 To facilitate further analysis, all ageing criterion calculation results are listed in Table 2.

462

463

Table 2. Calculation results for the unit #1 wind turbine

Criterion values Year	Power fluctuation	C_p	Vibration	Temperature
2015	1	1	1	1
2016	0.992	1.089	0.842	1.006

464 465

From Table 2, it can be seen that the values of all four ageing criteria deviate from 1. During the service life of a 466 467 wind turbine (normally 25-30 years), ageing will inevitably happen over time. However, the apparent ageing effect of the turbine should not be clearly observed within only one-year time. So, it can be said that separate analysis of 468 469 individual ageing assessment criterion cannot lead to a reliable assessment of turbine ageing effect. The sum of the four criteria is 3.929, which is smaller than 4 thus is unreasonable because ageing is inevitable even if within one-470 471 year time. Thus, it can be concluded that the conventional ageing assessment method proposed in Section 3.2 cannot 472 lead to a reliable assessment of the ageing of the turbine. Therefore, the information fusion method proposed in 473 Section 3.2 is applied to interpret the calculation results in Table 2. Substitute the calculated values of the four ageing 474 criteria in Table 2 and the weighting factors in Table 1 into (19), has

475
$$\delta = r_1 \cdot \delta_p + r_2 \cdot \delta_{Cp} + r_3 \cdot \delta_a + r_4 \cdot \delta_t$$
$$= 0.124 + 0.517 + 0.147 + 0.226$$
$$= 1.014$$
(20)

476 Obviously, such a result is more realistic and acceptable. According to (19), the value of the comprehensive ageing 477 assessment criterion δ is equal to 1 in the absence of ageing. Eqn. (20) gives a calculation result of 1.014, which 478 deviates from 1 by 1.4 %. Thus, it can be concluded that ageing of the turbine is small and ignorable over the course 479 from 2015 to 2016.

In order to further demonstrate the reliability and robustness of the proposed ageing assessment method, the SCADA data collected for another wind turbine (called unit #2) in the same wind farm are processed as well. The concept of the unit #2 turbine is exactly same as the unit #1 turbine and was installed also in 2011. Then, the four criteria for ageing assessment are calculated as well and the results are listed in Table 3.

From Table 3, it is found that the values of all four ageing criteria deviate from 1 as well. But it is noticed that the value of vibration criterion is smaller than 1, while the values of the other three criteria are larger than 1. This makes it difficult to draw a reliable ageing assessment conclusion. To overcome this issue, the comprehensive ageing assessment criterion is calculated as well. The result is equal to 1.085, which is a reasonable value to indicate the slight ageing problem of the wind turbine happening within one-year time. Thus, it can be concluded that in contrast to the individual ageing assessment criteria the comprehensive ageing assessment criterion is more effective to provide a reliable assessment of the ageing issues of wind turbines.

491

492

Criterion values Year	Power fluctuation	C_p	Vibration	Temperature
2015	1	1	1	1
2016	1.167	1.158	0.876	1.048

494

496 **5. Concluding remarks**

497 Unlike the previous effort that has been made to investigate the actual health condition and reliability issues in wind 498 turbines, SCADA-based preliminary research was firstly conducted in this paper in order to perform an ageing 499 assessment of a wind turbine. In the current practice of the wind farm operation and maintenance, the kind of issues 500 has not attracted much interest because the majority of modern wind turbines in operation today are at their young 501 ages. However, with the increase of their ages, the ageing issue will occur inevitably sooner or later. They are not 502 linked to any type of fault. But they can lead to the frequent presence of faults and reliability issues, thus increased 503 downtime and high wind turbine operation and maintenance cost. From this point of view, the research on the ageing 504 issue of a wind turbine is of great importance to improve the life management of a wind turbine and maximize its 505 economic return. In this paper, the ageing assessment research was started from discussing the SCADA parameters 506 that potentially can be used for ageing assessment. Then, four ageing assessment criteria were developed in order to 507 describe the ageing issues of wind turbines from different points of views and based on which, both a conventional 508 and information fusion based ageing assessment methods were developed. Finally, the effectiveness of the proposed 509 method in the ageing assessment was verified using real SCADA data collected from a wind farm. From the work 510 shown above, it can be concluded that the proposed information fusion based method is indeed effective in assessing 511 the ageing issues in a wind turbine, although further verification is still needed in the future.

Following this research, the proposed ageing assessment method will be further improved through optimizing the weighting factors by considering the views of more experts, and moreover, the method will be verified using more wind farm SCADA data. In addition, the ageing assessment of different concepts of wind turbines has not been considered in the research presented in this paper. In the future, different concepts of wind turbines will be distinguished when designing ageing assessment criteria and the influence of external environmental factors on turbine ageing will be considered as well. All new research achievements will be reported in separate papers.

518 Acknowledgements

This work reported in this paper is supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of People's Republic of China
(grant number 51475160, 11632011, 11472103) and State Scholarship Fund (grant number 201408430267), Hunan
Provincial Natural Science Foundation (grant number 2016JJ5024) and Scientific Research Fund of Hunan Provincial
Education Department (grant number 15B084).

523

524 **References**

- AMIRAT Y, BENBOUZID M E H, AL-AHMAR E, et al. A brief status on condition monitoring and fault diagnosis
 in wind energy conversion systems[J]. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews, 2009, 13(9): 2629-2636
- 527 [2] WATSON S J, XIANG B J, YANG W, et al. Condition monitoring of the power output of wind turbine generators

- 528 using wavelets[J]. Energy Conversion, IEEE Transactions on, 2010, 25(3): 715-721
- 529 [3] YANG W, TAVNER P J, CRABTREE C J, et al. Cost-effective condition monitoring for wind turbines[J]. Industrial
 530 Electronics, IEEE Transactions on, 2010, 57(1): 263-271
- [4] CHEN J, PAN J, LI Z, et al. Generator bearing fault diagnosis for wind turbine via empirical wavelet transform using
 measured vibration signals[J]. Renewable Energy, 2016, 89: 80-92
- 533 [5] BESNARD F, BERTLING L. An approach for condition-based maintenance optimization applied to wind turbine
 534 blades[J]. Sustainable Energy, IEEE Transactions on, 2010, 1(2): 77-83
- [6] LIU X, GAO Z. Takagi-sugeno fuzzy modelling and robust fault reconstruction for wind turbine systems[C].Industrial
 Informatics (INDIN), 2016 IEEE 14th International Conference on, 2016: IEEE: 492-495.
- FISCHER K, BESNARD F, BERTLING L. Reliability-centered maintenance for wind turbines based on statistical
 analysis and practical experience[J]. Energy Conversion, IEEE Transactions on, 2012, 27(1): 184-195
- 539 [8] GUO H, WATSON S, TAVNER P, et al. Reliability analysis for wind turbines with incomplete failure data collected
 540 from after the date of initial installation[J]. Reliability Engineering & System Safety, 2009, 94(6): 1057-1063
- [9] ARABIAN-HOSEYNABADI H, ORAEE H, TAVNER P. Failure modes and effects analysis (FMEA) for wind
 turbines[J]. International Journal of Electrical Power & Energy Systems, 2010, 32(7): 817-824
- [10] STAFFELL I, GREEN R. How does wind farm performance decline with age?[J]. Renewable energy, 2014, 66: 775 786
- 545 [11] GAO Z, CECATI C, DING S X. A survey of fault diagnosis and fault-tolerant techniques—part I: Fault diagnosis
 546 with model-based and signal-based approaches[J]. IEEE Transactions on Industrial Electronics, 2015, 62(6): 3757 547 3767
- 548 [12] GAO Z, CECATI C, DING S X. A survey of fault diagnosis and fault-tolerant techniques—part II: Fault diagnosis
 549 with knowledge-based and hybrid/active approaches[J]. IEEE Transactions on Industrial Electronics, 2015, 62(6):
 550 3768-3774
- [13] KUSIAK A, LI W. The prediction and diagnosis of wind turbine faults[J]. Renewable Energy, 2011, 36(1): 16-23
- [14] FENG Y, QIU Y, CRABTREE C J, et al. Use of SCADAA and CMS signals for failure detection and diagnosis of a
 wind turbine gearbox[C].European Wind Energy Conference and Exhibition, Sheffield, 2011: 17-19.
- [15] KIM K, PARTHASARATHY G, ULUYOL O, et al. Use of SCADAA data for failure detection in wind
 turbines[C].ASME 2011 5th International Conference on Energy Sustainability, Washington, DC, 2011: 2071-2079.
- [16] YONGJIE Z, DONGFENG W, JUNYING Z, et al. Research on early fault diagnostic method of wind turbines[J].
 TELKOMNIKA Indonesian Journal of Electrical Engineering, 2013, 11(5): 2330-2341
- [17] ZAHER A, MCARTHUR S, INFIELD D, et al. Online wind turbine fault detection through automated SCADAA data
 analysis[J]. Wind Energy, 2009, 12(6): 574-593
- [18] SCHLECHTINGEN M, SANTOS I F, ACHICHE S. Wind turbine condition monitoring based on SCADAA data
 using normal behavior models. Part 1: System description[J]. Applied Soft Computing, 2013, 13(1): 259-270
- 562 [19] SCHLECHTINGEN M, SANTOS I F. Wind turbine condition monitoring based on SCADAA data using normal
 563 behavior models. Part 2: Application examples[J]. Applied Soft Computing, 2014, 14: 447-460
- [20] YANG W, COURT R, JIANG J. Wind turbine condition monitoring by the approach of SCADAA data analysis[J].
 Renewable Energy, 2013, 53: 365-376
- [21] LOU J, SHAN K, XU J. A new condition monitoring method for wind turbines based on power curve model[J].
 International Journal of Control and Automation, 2016, 9(3): 393-408
- 568 [22] YANG W, TAVNER P J, CRABTREE C J, et al. Wind turbine condition monitoring: Technical and commercial
 569 challenges[J]. Wind Energy, 2014, 17(5): 973-693
- 570 [23] FENG Y, QIU Y, CRABTREE C J, et al. Monitoring wind turbine gearboxes[J]. Wind Energy, 2013, 16(5): 728-740
- 571 [24] YANG H, SHEN W, XU H, et al. Prediction of the wind turbine performance by using BEM with airfoil data extracted
 572 from CFD[J]. Renewable Energy, 2014, 70: 107-115
- 573 [25] LANZAFAME R, MESSINA M. Fluid dynamics wind turbine design: Critical analysis, optimization and application

- 574 of BEM theory[J]. Renewable Energy, 2007, 32(14): 2291-2305
- 575 [26] DAI J C, HU Y P, LIU D S, et al. Aerodynamic loads calculation and analysis for large scale wind turbine based on
 576 combining BEM modified theory with dynamic stall model[J]. Renewable Energy, 2011, 36(3): 1095-1104
- 577 [27] DAI J-C, HU Y-P, LIU D-S, et al. Modelling and analysis of direct-driven permanent magnet synchronous generator
 578 wind turbine based on wind-rotor neural network model [J]. Proceedings of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers,
 579 Part A: Journal of Power and Energy, 2012, 226(1): 62-72
- [28] HANSEN A, MICHALKE G. Modelling and control of variable-speed multi-pole permanent magnet synchronous
 generator wind turbine[J]. Wind Energy, 2008, 11(5): 537-554
- [29] VALENCIAGA F, FERNANDEZ R D. Multiple-input-multiple-output high-order sliding mode control for a
 permanent magnet synchronous generator wind-based system with grid support capabilities[J]. Renewable Power
 Generation, IET, 2015, 9(8): 925-934
- [30] MARTINEZ J, BERNABINI L, PROBST O, et al. An improved BEM model for the power curve prediction of stall regulated wind turbines[J]. Wind Energy, 2005, 8(4): 385-402
- [31] LAKSHMANAN K, ORTNER R, RYABKO D. Improved regret bounds for undiscounted continuous reinforcement
 learning[C].Proceedings of the 32nd International Conference on Machine Learning, Lille, 2015: 524-532.
- [32] LIU Z, SHI R, SHEN L, et al. Unsupervised salient object segmentation based on kernel density estimation and two phase graph cut[J]. Multimedia, IEEE Transactions on, 2012, 14(4): 1275-1289
- [33] BESSA R J, MIRANDA V, BOTTERUD A, et al. Time adaptive conditional kernel density estimation for wind power
 forecasting[J]. Sustainable Energy, IEEE Transactions on, 2012, 3(4): 660-669
- [34] DAI J, LIU D, WEN L, et al. Research on power coefficient of wind turbines based on SCADAA data[J]. Renewable
 Energy, 2016, 86: 206-215
- [35] WEI J, XUAN Y. Equations for calculating thermophysical properties of moist air[J]. Journal of HV&AC, 1996, 26(3):
 16-19

618 **Figure Caption:**

- 619 Fig.1 Power control structure of wind turbines when wind speed is above the rated wind speed
- 620 Fig.2 Mass-spring-damping model of the nacelle
- 621 Fig.3 Influence factors of main bearing temperature
- 622 Fig.4 Estimated output power fluctuation through kernel density analysis
- 623 Fig.5 Relationship between rotor speed and power
- 624 Fig.6 wind speed and power fluctuation in a sampling interval
- 625 Fig.6a Wind speed
- 626 Fig.6b Power fluctuation
- 627 Fig.7 Histogram and kernel density estimation of power fluctuation
- 628 Fig.8 Histogram and kernel density estimation of power coefficient
- 629 Fig.9 Histogram and kernel density estimation of vibration acceleration
- 630 Fig.10 Histogram and kernel density estimation of bearing temperature
- 631
- 632

633 Table Caption:

- Table 1. Weighting factors assigned to the four ageing assessment criteria
- 635 Table 2. Calculation results for the unit #1 wind turbine
- Table 3. Calculation results for the unit #2 wind turbine